

**UNITED STATES JUDICIAL PANEL
on
MULTIDISTRICT LITIGATION**

**IN RE: ETHICON, INC., PELVIC
REPAIR SYSTEM PRODUCTS
LIABILITY LITIGATION**

MDL No. 2327

TRANSFER ORDER

Before the Panel: Plaintiff in the action listed on Schedule A (*Sullivan*) moves under Panel Rule 7.1 to vacate our order conditionally transferring the action to MDL No. 2327. Responding defendants Ethicon, Inc., and Johnson & Johnson (collectively, Ethicon) oppose the motion to vacate.

After considering the argument of counsel, we find this action involves common questions of fact with the actions previously transferred to MDL No. 2327, and that transfer under 28 U.S.C. § 1407 will serve the convenience of the parties and witnesses and promote the just and efficient conduct of the litigation. Plaintiff does not dispute that her action shares questions of fact with MDL No. 2327. Like many of the already-centralized actions, *Sullivan* involves factual questions arising from allegations that Ethicon and related entities defectively designed, manufactured, and marketed pelvic surgical mesh products, resulting in serious injuries, and that defendants failed to provide appropriate warnings and instructions regarding the risks and dangers posed by the devices. *See In re: Ethicon, Inc., Pelvic Repair Sys. Prods. Liab. Litig., et al.*, 844 F. Supp. 2d 1359 (J.P.M.L. 2012).

In support of the motion to vacate, plaintiff argues, *inter alia*, that (1) her action is unique because she received multiple surgical procedures when the pelvic mesh at issue was implanted; and (2) most parties will be inconvenienced by transfer as they are located in Maryland, where plaintiff's surgery took place. Though this action may present some individual factual issues, "this is usually true of products liability cases and medical device cases, in particular." *In re: Cook Medical, Inc., Pelvic Repair Sys. Prods. Liab. Litig.*, 949 F. Supp. 2d 1373, 1375 (J.P.M.L. 2013). Indeed, many MDL No. 2327 cases also will involve unique factual issues concerning each plaintiff's particular surgery and medical history. Moreover, we have found that, while transfer of a particular action might inconvenience some parties to that action, transfer often is necessary to further the expeditious resolution of the litigation taken as a whole. *See, e.g., In re: Crown Life Ins. Premium Ins. Litig.*, 178 F. Supp. 2d 1365, 1366 (J.P.M.L. 2001).

IT IS THEREFORE ORDERED that the action listed on Schedule A is transferred to the Southern District of West Virginia and, with the consent of that court, assigned to the Honorable Joseph R. Goodwin for inclusion in the coordinated or consolidated pretrial proceedings.

-2-

PANEL ON MULTIDISTRICT LITIGATION

A handwritten signature in black ink, reading "Sarah Vance", is positioned above a horizontal line.

Sarah S. Vance
Chair

Marjorie O. Rendell
Lewis A. Kaplan
R. David Proctor

Charles R. Breyer
Ellen Segal Huvelle
Catherine D. Perry

**IN RE: ETHICON, INC., PELVIC
REPAIR SYSTEM PRODUCTS
LIABILITY LITIGATION**

MDL No. 2327

SCHEDULE A

District of Maryland

SULLIVAN v. CALVERT MEMORIAL HOSPITAL, ET AL., C.A. No. 8:15-01188



Activity in Case MDL No. 2327 IN RE: Ethicon, Inc., Pelvic Repair System Products Liability Litigation Existing Transfer Order (Transferee Court)

JPMLCMECF

to:

JPMLCMDECF

08/07/2015 02:48 PM

Hide Details

From: JPMLCMECF@jpml.uscourts.gov

To: JPMLCMDECF@jpml.uscourts.gov

This is an automatic e-mail message generated by the CM/ECF system. Please DO NOT RESPOND to this e-mail because the mail box is unattended.

United States

United States Judicial Panel on Multidistrict Litigation

Notice of Electronic Filing

The following transaction was entered on 8/7/2015 at 2:47 PM EDT and filed on 8/7/2015

Case Name: IN RE: Ethicon, Inc., Pelvic Repair System Products Liability Litigation

Case Number: [MDL No. 2327](#)

Filer:

Document Number: No document attached

Docket Text:

TEXT ONLY ENTRY

MINUTE ORDER -- TO TRANSFEEER CLERK: ACTION REQUIRED

A transfer order has been filed today in this litigation. The order is directed to your court for filing. Rule 2.1 of the Rules of Procedure of the Judicial Panel on Multidistrict Litigation, states...An order to transfer or remand pursuant to 28 U.S.C. 1407 shall be effective only upon its filing with the clerk of the transferee district court.

Signed by Clerk of the Panel Jeffery N. Luthi on 8/7/2015.

Associated Cases: MDL No. 2327, MD/8:15-cv-01188 (DP)

Case Name: Sullivan v. Calvert Memorial Hospital et al

Case Number: [MD/8:15-cv-01188](#)

Filer:

Document Number: No document attached

Docket Text:

TEXT ONLY ENTRY

MINUTE ORDER -- TO TRANSFEEER CLERK: ACTION REQUIRED

A transfer order has been filed today in this litigation. The order is directed to your court

for filing. Rule 2.1 of the Rules of Procedure of the Judicial Panel on Multidistrict Litigation, states...An order to transfer or remand pursuant to 28 U.S.C. 1407 shall be effective only upon its filing with the clerk of the transferee district court.

Signed by Clerk of the Panel Jeffery N. Luthi on 8/7/2015.

Associated Cases: MDL No. 2327, MD/8:15-cv-01188 (DP)

No public notice (electronic or otherwise) sent because the entry is private



Activity in Case MDL No. 2327 IN RE: Ethicon, Inc., Pelvic Repair System Products
Liability Litigation Transfer Order
JPMLCMECF

to:

JPMLCMDECF

08/07/2015 02:47 PM

Hide Details

From: JPMLCMECF@jpml.uscourts.gov

To: JPMLCMDECF@jpml.uscourts.gov

This is an automatic e-mail message generated by the CM/ECF system. Please DO NOT RESPOND to this e-mail because the mail box is unattended.

*****NOTE TO PUBLIC ACCESS USERS***** Judicial Conference of the United States policy permits attorneys of record and parties in a case (including pro se litigants) to receive one free electronic copy of all documents filed electronically, if receipt is required by law or directed by the filer. PACER access fees apply to all other users. To avoid later charges, download a copy of each document during this first viewing. However, if the referenced document is a transcript, the free copy and 30 page limit do not apply.

United States

United States Judicial Panel on Multidistrict Litigation

Notice of Electronic Filing

The following transaction was entered on 8/7/2015 at 2:46 PM EDT and filed on 8/7/2015

Case Name: IN RE: Ethicon, Inc., Pelvic Repair System Products Liability Litigation

Case Number: [MDL No. 2327](#)

Filer:

Document Number: [2120](#)

Docket Text:

TRANSFER ORDER re: pldg. (9 in MD/8:15-cv-01188, [2013] in MDL No. 2327), (12 in MD/8:15-cv-01188, [2033] in MDL No. 2327)

Transferring 1 action(s) - MDL No. 2327, MD/8:15-cv-01188

Signed by Judge Sarah S. Vance, Chair, PANEL ON MULTIDISTRICT LITIGATION, on 8/7/2015.

Associated Cases: MDL No. 2327, MD/8:15-cv-01188 (DP)

Case Name: Sullivan v. Calvert Memorial Hospital et al

Case Number: [MD/8:15-cv-01188](#)

Filer:

Document Number: [14](#)

Docket Text:

TRANSFER ORDER re: pldg. (9 in MD/8:15-cv-01188, [2013] in MDL No. 2327), (12 in

MD/8:15-cv-01188, [2033] in MDL No. 2327)

Transferring 1 action(s) - MDL No. 2327, MD/8:15-cv-01188

Signed by Judge Sarah S. Vance, Chair, PANEL ON MULTIDISTRICT LITIGATION, on 8/7/2015.

Associated Cases: MDL No. 2327, MD/8:15-cv-01188 (DP)

MDL No. 2327 Notice has been electronically mailed to:

Carl N Frankovitch carl@facslaw.com, terry@facslaw.com

Michael J Farrell mjf@farrell3.com

Michael Bonasso mbonasso@fsblaw.com, etaylor@fsblaw.com, mdl@fsblaw.com, nthompson@fsblaw.com

Harry F. Bell, Jr hfbell@belllaw.com, camclain@belllaw.com

DAVID B. THOMAS dthomas@tcspllc.com, rdavis@tcspllc.com

Paul T. Farrell, Jr paul@greeneketchum.com, lora@greeneketchum.com

Marc E. Williams marc.williams@nelsonmullins.com

MDL No. 2327 Notice will not be electronically mailed to:

MD/8:15-cv-01188 Notice has been electronically mailed to:

Christy D. Jones christy.jones@butlersnow.com, MOMullan@RIKER.com, ashley.lampkin@butlersnow.com, brandy.pitts@butlersnow.com, catherine.mason@butlersnow.com, ecf.notices@butlersnow.com, kcrawford@riker.com, mkabbash@riker.com

Bruce Robert Parker brparker@venable.com

Shannon Beamer sebeamer@venable.com

Kimm Hudley Massey masseylawfirm@gmail.com

Erica C Mudd emudd@adclawfirm.com

Andrew E Vernick avernick@verniclegal.com

Craig B Merkle cbm@gdldlaw.com

MD/8:15-cv-01188 Notice will not be electronically mailed to:

The following document(s) are associated with this transaction:

Document description:Main Document

Original filename:n/a

Electronic document Stamp:

[STAMP JPMLStamp_ID=1090522767 [Date=8/7/2015] [FileNumber=583971-0] [12775baf15f82189d11a1290a9f8bdffba9623dfe8ad42e3497ebde28fdd66753a54dcf1d1ac47f5913f7c7b36a718577b03c0e8c0ca1bcf5c2e12aa3b624c13]]